

Hoosier Archives was originally a periodic listing of the Diplomacy archives of Walter Buchanan, R.R. 3, Lebanon, Indiana 46052, telephone (317) 482-2824; Archives Director, PDC, and a member of "DipOrg," TDA, IFWDS and the PDRC. It is now primarily a Diplomacy genzine devoted to articles on good play, demonstration games such as The Grudge Game (1971BC) now in progress, rating systems and game news. Information from the archives is vital for all this and is available to the public as well. Although the archives is virtually complete in at least xerox form, missing undamaged originals are solicited, either for purchase or a loan to permit xeroxing. (See the last archives listing in Hoosier Archives #53 for zines needed.) Many original spares are now available from the archives; more are solicited so as to make them available to others. A subscription to Hoosier Archives is 15/\$2.00 or 7/\$1.00; back issues are available for 15¢ apiece (20% discount for all available). Ask for #73 to get a list of all articles through #74. This is Albatross Press publication #82.



INTO THE ARCHIVES NO. 34

One of the hobby's leading authorities on rating systems, Doug Beyerlein, is back with us again for an excellent comparison of the current rating systems. This should prove to be a valuable reference source for all of you out there who are getting confused by all the new rating systems that are cropping up now! It is hard to believe that 2 years ago the CPCL was the only one around being currently published!

A COMPARISON OF RATING SYSTEMS by Douglas Beyerlein

Currently, as of June, 1972, there are five basic rating systems in use for Postal Diplomacy games. These are: Antares (Burt Labelle), Brobdingnag (Jeff Power), CPCL (Walt Buchanan), Numenor (Rod Walker), and ODD (John McCallum). The five rating systems may be divided into two classes or ideologies. The zero-sum ratings are the Brobdingnag and ODD systems of scoring where the gain of one player is a loss of score to another. The arbitrary style systems give points on scales solely designed by their creators. The two of this system in present use are the Antares and Numenor ratings. The CPCL--Calhauer Point Count Listing--is a modified zero-sum type rating.

All rating systems attempt to do about the same thing. They reward the victor and in various degrees reward or punish the defeated. The variety of points given for the partial and non-winner is what I propose to discuss in this article. I have taken the points given for each possible type of finish for each system and divided them by the number of points for a win. With this done for each of the five rating systems, it is possible to directly compare various game-end positions as they relate to each different rating system.

Below are the decimal fractions for various finishes for a win, equalling 1.000 point for each rating system. A number of simplifications have been made and have been noted in the following footnotes.

	<u>Antares</u>	<u>ODD</u> ⁴	<u>Brob</u>	<u>CPCL</u>	<u>Numenor</u> ⁷
Win	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000
Draws					
2-way	.428 ¹	.500	.833	.500 ⁶	.750 ¹
3-way	.286 ¹	.333	.667	.333	.500 ¹
4-way	.214 ¹	.250	.500	.250	.350 ¹
5-way	.143 ¹	.200	.333	.200	.250 ¹
6-way	- 2	.167	.167	.167	.150 ¹

	<u>Antares</u>	<u>ODD</u>	<u>Prob</u>	<u>CPCL</u>	<u>Numenor</u> ⁷
Places					
2nd	.286	-.1675	.667	.000	.500
3rd	.1433	-.167	.333	.000	.350
4th	.1433	-.167	.000	.000	.300
5th	.1433	-.167	-.333	.000	.250
6th	.0003	-.167	-.667	.000	.100
7th	.0003	-.167	-1.000	.000	.000
Survival	.143	-	-	-	.150
Elim.	.000	-	-	-	.000-.100 ⁸
Resign	.000	-	-	-	.000-.100 ⁹
Drop	.000	-	-	-	-.050

Footnotes:

1. only the major survivors draw
2. did not state
3. 1 pt. is given for survival, 0 pt. for elimination (the numbers listed are based on a hypothetical finish of 18-9-4-2-1-0 (out '07) -0 (out '04))
4. all ODD analysis is based on a game where all the players have the same score before the game's end; therefore, there is no player factor effect included
5. all 2nd through 7th place finishes are based on a win; see Pfennig-Halbfennig #4 for a fuller discussion
6. draws are listed as fractions of 60 in all CPC Listings, e.g., .500 equals 30/60 or 0:30
7. for the 2nd - 7th place finishes, points are added to the initial finish points according to survival, elimination, time and event (see Numenor #15 for the total picture); in my analysis, the points were computed for the hypothetical finish given in Footnote 3
8. varies according to the length of time survived
9. treated as elimination

What the above numbers show is how the different rating systems compare for each type of finish. The Broddingnag system rewards draws and the 2nd place finish higher than any of the other systems. It is also the hardest on the last place finishers which is a common trait of the zero-sum systems. The Numenor system gives the second highest scores for draws and is also very generous to other survivors. This is considered by some to be the major drawback of the arbitrary style ratings.

The ODD and CPCL are identical in the draw category. The only apparent difference is in the 2nd through 7th place finishes, and only by an amount of .167. Actually, however, the ODD scores are governed by a player factor which can in extremes negate or double win or draw points. Because of the player factor, the ODD ratings are the most different of all the various systems.

The Antares system is very similar to the CPCL except in the area of non-winning/non-drawing survivors. This is as expected as Antares is extremely close to the now-defunct Big Brother rating system. A few years back, John McCallum made a comparison between players' scores in the CPCL and BB Listings and found a very close correlation. This will probably be true for Antares when Labelle gets the players' scores updated.

The relationships between the different rating systems are all very interesting as they are directly influenced by their originator's philosophies regarding the game of Diplomacy. Because of these differences, average players will rate anywhere from very good to very poor depending on the system. Thus, it should be they, and not the top players, who should show the most interest in the different systems. So get out today and support the rating system of your choice. Remember, in your heart you know that you're the best.

And now, what you've all been waiting for----that bloodiest battle of them all,

3.

THE GRUDGE GAME (1971BC)

Fall 1905

MIRSAN BLITZKRIEG CONTINUES AS WALKER THIRD TO GET THE KNIFE; LAKOFKA AVENGED?

AUSTRIA: A Gal-Vie, A Bud S A Cal-Vie, A Tri S A Gal-Vie, A Bul H, F Con S Russian F Arm-Ank /x/ (Aeg, d). Owns: Bud, Tri, Vie, Ser, Bul, ~~Vie~~ (5). Constant.

FRANCE: F Edi-Nwg, F Nth-Nwy, F Ska-Swe, F Eng-Nth, A Ber-Pru, A Kie-Mun, A Ruh S A Kie-Mun, A Bur-Bel, A Tyr-Ven, A Pio S A Tyr-Ven, F Tyr-Nap. Owns: Bre, Mar, Par, Por, Spa, Edi, Liv, Lon, Bel, Hol, Mun, Ber, Swe, Nap, Ven (15). Build 4 (only room for 3).

GERMANY: A Sil-Cal, F Den S French F Ska-Swe, A Vie S Italian A Ven-Tri /x/ (Boh, Tyr, d). Owns: ~~Den~~, Kie, Den (2). Remove 1.

ITALY: A Ven-Tri /x/ (Tus, Rom, d), A Rom-Apu, F Tun-Tyr, F Aeg-Gre, A Smy-Con. Owns: Rom, ~~Nap~~, ~~Tun~~, Smy, Gre, Con (5). Constant.

RUSSIA: F Nwg S F Nwy, F Nwy S A Swe, A Swe S F Nwy /x/ (Fin, d), A War-Sil, A Pru S A War-Sil, A Rus-Sev, F Arm-Ank. Owns: Mos, StP, Sev, War, Rus, Nwy, ~~Nap~~ (6). Remove 1.

TURKEY: (Su05: A Arm R Ank) F Bla S Italian A Smy-Con, A Ank S Italian A Smy-Con. (Beyerlein) Owns: Ank, ~~Den~~ (1). Remove 1.

1ST STBY (Naus): Moves for all Great Powers received.

2ND STBY (Eller): Moves for all Great Powers received.

Winter 1905 Orders are due not later than noon (9:00 A.M. for phone calls) on Saturday, 10 June 1972. Remember that this is only one week away. Builds and retreats should be sent by return mail.

Note: Doug Beyerlein now has a new zip code: 98136.

ANALYSIS (Spring 1905): Rick Brooks, (R.R. 1, Box 167, Fremont, Indiana 46737; comments are invited).

Mirsan has really taken the bit in his teeth. First England and now Germany give up all their home centers without a fight. Barring a miracle (such as all the other players working together or one of them joining the postal service in Mirsan's neighborhood), France has the game. He now has 13 centers as Munich can be held by moving only one unit there. FA Burgundy (S) FA Ruhz to Munich will give position even if Germany gets cold feet. France could gain another center by moving FA Kiel (S) FF North Sea to Denmark, FF Skagerrak to Sweden, and FF Edinburgh (S) FF English Channel to North Sea. This risks the annihilation of FF Skagerrak by RF Norway (S) GF Denmark to Skagerrak. Russia could support GA Silesia to Berlin, but this might not go unless GF Denmark hit Kiel to cut support. However, Russia may prefer to mind his own business and finish as well as possible instead of tilting at French windmills.

But Germany will probably continue to help France. If he was going to hit France, he let his opportunity pretty well fade by not going sooner. FF Edinburgh to Norwegian, FF Skagerrak (S) FF North Sea to Norway, GF Denmark to Sweden, and FF English Channel to North Sea will take Norway with RF Norway probably retreating to St. Petersburg (NC).

So France's flanks look much better. Two builds (barring an unexpected German double-cross that takes Berlin while leaving RA Sweden to support RF Norway while France hits it) can give him FF Brest and FF Marseilles. Assume the worse, namely RF Norwegian to North Atlantic and IF Tunis to Western Mediterranean in the fall. FF Marseilles to Spain (SC), FF Brest to Mid-Atlantic, and FA Burgundy to Gascony in the spring will block all supply centers except Liverpool. Russia can take Liverpool. But FF North Sea (S) FF Norway, FF Skagerrak (S) GF Denmark to Sweden, and FF Norwegian to Barents will cost Russia Sweden in the spring and possibly St. Petersburg in the fall.

If IF Western Mediterranean (S) RF North Atlantic to Mid-Atlantic, FF Brest to Mid-

Atlantic. FF Spain (SC) to Portugal, FA Gascony to Spain, and FF Tyrrhenian Sea to Western Mediterranean will prevent any damage in the fall. If Western Mediterranean to Gulf of Lyon will mean at least a standoff over Mid-Atlantic in the spring. Then FF Spain (SC) to Marseilles and FA Gascony to Marseilles will block Marseilles and leave it open for a possible fleet build. Russia and Italy can only inconvenience France behind the lines and it will probably cost them more than they can gain.

Italy has problems. Letting France take the Tyrrhenian was bad. If Tunis (S) IF Ionian to Tyrrhenian will dislodge FF Tyrrhenian. But he can retreat to Naples and get another build. FF Tyrrhenian to Rome is probable, especially if he goes for Venice. With three Austrian units on Vienna, FA Tyrolia (S) GA Vienna is likely to be wasted effort. FA Piedmont (S) FA Tyrolia to Venice is more likely. Italy can gamble on a French support of GA Vienna and move IA Venice to Rome, IA Rome to Naples and IF Tunis (S) IF Ionian to Tyrrhenian. AA Trieste (S) IA Venice, IA Rome to Naples, and IF Ionian to Naples is a stopgap as by spring, France can have a fleet in the Gulf of Lyon. But there is Ankara. A build of IF Naples could put the pressure on France.

Turkey is likely to retreat to Ankara as TF Black Sea cannot work with TA Syria except to support him into Armenia. TF Black Sea can support TA Ankara to Constantinople (or Armenia), or convoy TA Ankara to Sevastopol or Rumania. Turkey basically has to outguess Russia. RF Armenia and AF Constantinople (S) IA Smyrna to Ankara will give Italy his build. AA Bulgaria (S) AF Constantinople will hold Constantinople. But Russia may not care to give Italy a build when the result may be the loss of a center of his. RF Armenia to Sevastopol and RA Rumania to Sevastopol will block any possible convoy (it is very doubtful that Turkey will wipe out RF Armenia by supporting TA Ankara in) and Turkey will be forced to make a removal of one unit, possibly two, if he tries a convoy while Russia blocks Sevastopol and Italy is supported into Ankara. But Russia might gamble since he needs to shore up his northern front. If both Turkish units were gone, he could afford to remove RF Armenia and head RA Rumania north.

Austria's attack on Vienna could give Russia problems. What AA Trieste does depends on the alliance with Italy. GA Silesia to Galicia to cut possible attack support is probable, so Austria will probably move AA Budapest (S) AA Galicia to Vienna. Russia might have to worry about a German army on his flank tying down RA Warsaw and RA Rumania. Blocking Galicia with RA Rumania risks the loss of Rumania. But the problem is more apparent than real. If AA Galicia moves, it will take back Vienna. That will probably leave Germany with one center, and keeping GA Galicia while removing GF Denmark would help Russia in the north. RA Warsaw (S) RA Prussia will prevent GA Silesia (S) FA Berlin to Prussia.

France's moves will largely decide the direction of the game now. Only Turkey doesn't have to take his moves into consideration.

DEGRUDGINGS

HITT AL-CUSHER (5 Shawwal 1323): Here we are, ladies and gentlemen, in the Golden Tent, the most plush gambling establishment outside of Monaco, already referred to as the Jewel in the Brew of Al-Shambla, which is the capital of the Sultanate of Hitt al-Cusher. This is your reporter, Walter Hunt Brinkel, bringing you all the news from the most exciting game since roulette was invented. Veritable fortunes are staked on the outcome of the Great European War. Rumor has it that such American millionaires as John D. Rockefeller, J.P. Morgan, Jay Gould, and Thomas Alva Edison have wagered substantial portions of their financial empires on the fates of the warring powers. His Sublimity, Sultan Kulak the First is here tonight, surrounded 10 or 12 deep by his harem and some pretty fierce-looking eunuchs.

Well, here we go. Chief Croupier Ambrando Honj is coming out to post the official odds. ...Oops!...tripped on his beard, there. --Now they're unwrapping him..O.K., he's ready to write. He's at the Big Board. The tension is terrific here, ladies and gentlemen; you can feel it; strong men are weeping and clutching their money belts...

FRANCE: 3-2. Well, there it is. France is still the favored belligerant, her odds unchanged. French Ambassatrix, Madame Edie Bierane, is hugging and kissing everyone around --everyone, that is, except Ambrando Honj. There are limits, even for the French...I mean, Honj's beard moves sometimes even when there is no breeze, y'know what I mean? So Madame Bierane is really happy and champagne bottles are popping and the Marseillaise is being sung

and the Marquis de Sade is lashing around with his whip...yeicks! Some Foreign Legionnaires with spray paint cans have just painted Honj's beard red, white, and blue. Very striking, I must say.

RUSSIA: 4-1. Here's a surprise! Russia's odds are much improved from being almost 6-1 last year. Ambassador Ivan Shmidze seems overjoyed. His broad face is contorted by what seems to be a smile--you never know with Shmidze...all those sharp teeth...anyway, he's pouring vodka and red pepper all 'round. Madame Birsane is mixing it with her champagne-and absinthe cocktail...it's going to be a wild evening. The music you hear in the background is the Russian national anthem, "God Help the Czar," or something like that. It's hard to translate because Russian never turns out to mean what you thought it did...

ITALY: 17-2. Wow! Ladies and gentlemen, Italy's odds are terrible, worse than last year's, and yet Italy is third on the list. Ambassador Ruggiero Zucchini, whose imminent retirement to his family estates at Baradfeltoni is rumored all over al-Shambiz, is visibly disturbed. This assignment was important to his career. He was sent here originally as a punishment for comparing Her Holiness the Pope favorably with a Miss Gladys Ormphy of Burbank, California, and if he can't keep the odds up any higher than this...well, as they say, Grouper Honj is so honest, he'll only take a bribe from an Arab. Count Zucchini is screaming, ranting, foaming, at the mouth...you can hear him, I guess..."It's all an Arab plot," he's saying.

AUSTRIA: 11-1. Austrian Ambassador Baron Leonardo von Kafka is just sitting there. He has been in a state of shock ever since the fall of Vienna. Rumor has it that Emperor Leo I is hiding out in Hungary, or possibly in Italy, and von Kafka can't locate him for any instructions on what to do. This simple-minded faith, that Emperor Leo knows what to do, is ample indication as to why von Kafka has been Ambassador here since 1867, when al-Shambiz was the most God-forsaken outpost of the Austrian Diplomatic corps.

GERMANY: 695-2. This is a real disaster, folks. The Graf von Warren...say, where is the Graf, anyway? Oh, there is he, under Madame Birsan's table. Anyway, the Graf has invested heavily in this game, or so it is rumored. The Graf is getting up. What do you suppose...? Oh, Madame Birsan just told him to play dead. He does that pretty well. Ah! Now she's throwing a bone..."Fetch," she says..there he goes! Boy, look at the Graf fetch that bone. That was pretty good. He's back under the table, chewing the bone, I guess.

TURKEY: 1000-1. There we are, ladies and gentlemen, a real thousand-to-one shot. No takers, though. I hear the new Turkish Ambassador, Bey Iar-Lyhs, who came in last month on the Omani tramp steamer al-Raunch, hasn't even unpacked his bags.

ENGLAND: scratch. Yeah, so what else is new?

ROME VIA BUDAPEST (1 April 1905): Having received a large shipment of goods from France Roman Mayor Roddy Wacker ran down to the train station to see the gifts sent by Premier Edyth de Birsan. A huge 29-car train of tank cars and a large box awaited him. Inside was a beautiful fiddle, a note, and a cigar. The note read: "My Dearest Roddy, A little gift from the people of France. To get the best effect, douse every house in Rome with some of the Naptha from the 29 tank cars. Go to the heart of Rome, light the cigar (be sure to toss the lighted match into a puddle of Naptha before extinguishing it) and begin to play the fiddle. Love, Edyth de Birsan" "He takes me for a fool! 29 cars of Naptha won't cover every house in Rome!" and promptly Wacker ordered 10 more tank cars brought up from Naples and proceeded to follow instructions. Hours later a sound of an out-of-tune fiddle was being drowned out by the crackle of flames and the screams of the populace trying to escape the debacle. "But what a lovely light," Wacker was heard to say as he burned to a crisp in the ashes of Rome.

BERLIN (VIA ST. PETERSBURG) TO THE REMAINING POWERS OF EUROPE (3 October 1905): Whose turn is it next over the Birsan barrel?

ANKARA (22 November 1905): Well, I am glad to see that you guys finally got together on something--the destruction of Turkey. However, it really does not bother me as Trotick destroyed the position before I got to do anything. Just hope that you can now turn around in time to stop Birsan. Farewell. Okay, Walt, what do I get to do when Turkey is gone? Maybe challenge Brooks to a one-on-one? The lonely fate of a used stand-by...

COW PASTURES: Press from Pope Joan, Queen Suzanne and Analyst Brooks will be carried next issue. Stay tuned!